

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's office at (310) 618-2780. Notification 48 hours prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements to ensure accessibility to this meeting. [28CFR35.102-35.104 ADA Title II]

Direct questions or concerns to the Commission Liaison at (310) 618-2967 or individual department head prior to submission to the Commission. Parties will be notified if the complaint will be included on a subsequent agenda.

The Civil Service Commission is an advisory body to the City Council that meets on the second and fourth Mondays of each month at 6:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers and on other Mondays as required. All meetings are open to the public except for those portions related to personnel issues that under law may be considered in closed session.

**TORRANCE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION AGENDA
MONDAY, JULY 22, 2024
REGULAR MEETING
6:00 P.M. IN HUMAN RESOURCES MULTI-PURPOSE ROOM
AT 3231 TORRANCE BL.**

**CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MAY TAKE ACTION ON ANY ITEM
LISTED ON THE AGENDA**

1. CALL MEETING TO ORDER

ROLL CALL: Commission members Adelsman, Herring, Kohus, Lohnes, Sasaki, Zygielbaum, Chair Hamada

2. FLAG SALUTE:

3. REPORT OF STAFF ON THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was posted on the Public Notice Board at 3031 Torrance Bl. and on the City's Website on Thursday, July 18, 2024.

4. ANNOUNCEMENT OF WITHDRAWN, DEFERRED, AND/OR SUPPLEMENTAL ITEMS

5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

This portion of the meeting is reserved for comment on items under the Consent Calendar or items that are not on the agenda. Under the Ralph M. Brown Act, Commissioners cannot act on items raised during public comment, but may respond briefly to statements made or questions posed; request clarification; or refer the item to staff. Speakers under this Public Comment period will have no longer than 1 minute per speaker. Speakers please turn off or leave your cellular phone when you come to the podium to speak.

6. CONSENT CALENDAR

Matters listed under the Consent Calendar are considered routine and will be enacted by one motion and one vote. There will be no separate discussion of these items. If discussion is desired, that item will be removed by a Commissioner from the Consent Calendar and considered separately.

6A. Accept and File the 2023-2024 Civil Service Commission Annual Report.

Recommendation of Civil Service Staff that your Honorable Body accept and file the 2023-2024 Civil Service Commission annual report.

6B. Approve the Examination for Hazardous Materials Response Team.

Recommendation of the Human Resources Director that your Honorable Body approve conducting the Hazardous Materials Response Team Premium Pay Assignment examination consisting of a Written Exam (100%). Staff is requesting approval for a two-year eligible list.

7. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS

7A. Appoint Civil Service Commission Chair, Civil Service Commission Vice-Chair, and members of Employee Relations Committee for Fiscal Year 2024-2025.

Recommendation of Civil Service Staff that:

1. Your Honorable Body appoint a Chair for Fiscal Year 2024 – 2025,
2. The Chair-elect appoints a Vice-Chair for Fiscal Year 2024 – 2025,
3. The Chair-elect appoints members of the Employee Relations Committee for Fiscal Year 2024 – 2025.

8. HEARINGS

8A. Appeal of Discipline of a Reprographics Specialist.

Consideration of public employee discipline will be conducted in closed session per California Government Code Section 54957(b)(1), unless the employee requests to have the appeal conducted in public session.

9. CLOSED SESSION

No Business to Consider

10. COMMISSION ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

11. ADJOURNMENT

11A. Adjournment of Civil Service Commission Meeting to Monday, August 12, 2024 at 6:00 p.m. in the Council Chamber.



Honorable Chair and Members
of the Civil Service Commission
City Hall
Torrance, California

Honorable Members:

SUBJECT: ACCEPT AND FILE THE 2023-2024 CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ANNUAL REPORT.

RECOMMENDATION:

Recommendation of Civil Service Staff that your Honorable Body accept and file the 2023-2024 Civil Service Commission annual report.

BACKGROUND/ANALYSIS:

Section 13.10.7 (d) of the Torrance Municipal Code (TMC) states that "The Commission shall make an annual report to the City Council of its activities for the previous year and shall make such other reports as it shall deem necessary or proper."

The Annual Report for July 2023 through June 2024 is attached for your consideration.

Respectfully submitted,



By _____

Jennica Chaparro
Senior Human Resources Analyst

CONCUR:



Brianne Cohen
Civil Service Manager

Attachment: A) 2023-2024 Civil Service Commission Annual Report



**City of Torrance
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

**ANNUAL REPORT
for July 2023 to June 2024**

Purpose of the Commission

The Civil Service Commission is a seven-member governing body with authority over Civil Service positions. The Commission approves testing plans to fill positions for City employment; reviews new and revised classifications (job descriptions); and serves as an appellant board on matters regarding the employee selection process, appeals of below standard performance evaluations, and disciplinary actions. A sub-committee of the Commission, the Employee Relations Committee (ERC), assigns newly created positions to employee representation units.

The Civil Service Commission is regularly scheduled to meet on the second and fourth Monday of each month at 6:00 p.m. and on other Mondays as required. All meetings are open to the public except for those portions related to personnel issues that under law may be considered in closed session. The meetings for July 2023 to June 2024 were held in LeRoy J. Jackson Council Chambers.

Membership of the Commission

The following Commission members served on the Civil Service Commission between July 2023 to June 2024:

MEMBER	OFFICE	APPOINTED OR REAPPOINTED
Marianne Hamada	Chair	2021
Cinda Herring	Vice Chair / ERC Chair	2020
Jean Adelsman	Member	2023
Julie Kohus	Member	2023
Laura Lohnes	Member	2022
Hana Sasaki	Member / ERC Member	2021
David Zygielbaum	Member / ERC Member	2022

Meetings

The Civil Service Commission met on the following dates:

July 10, 2023	November 6, 2023	March 11, 2024
July 24, 2023	November 13, 2023	March 18, 2024
July 31, 2023	November 27, 2023	March 25, 2024
August 7, 2023	December 4, 2023	April 8, 2024
August 14, 2023	December 11, 2023	April 22, 2024
August 28, 2023	January 8, 2024	May 6, 2024
September 11, 2023	January 22, 2024	May 13, 2024
September 18, 2023	January 29, 2024	May 20, 2024
September 25, 2023	February 5, 2024	June 10, 2024
October 16, 2023	February 26, 2024	June 24, 2024
October 23, 2023	March 4, 2024	

The Employee Relations Committee met on the following dates: July 10, 2023, July 31, 2023, August 7, 2023, and March 11, 2024.

Summary of Annual Activities

The Civil Service Commission held 32 meetings, during which a total of 38 examinations were approved.

Administrative Matters

The Civil Service Commission approved the revised class specification for the following classifications: Deputy City Attorney III, Police Captain, Senior Custodian, and Human Resources Technician.

The Civil Service Commission approved the title change for Fire Prevention Manager to Fire Prevention Manager/Fire Marshal and approved the revised class specification for Fire Prevention Manager/Fire Marshal.

The Civil Service Commission approved the title change for Planning Manager to Principal Planner and approved the revised class specification for Principal Planner.

The Civil Service Commission approved the proposed class specification for Budget Supervisor and Fire Prevention Supervisor.

The Civil Service Commission approved the reclassification of one incumbent to Legal Assistant II, one incumbent to Systems Analyst, one incumbent to Human Resources Technician, and one incumbent to Principal Human Resources Analyst.

The Civil Service Commission accepted and filed the Torrance Civil Center Master Plan and Economic Feasibility Study.

The Civil Service Commission appointed the Civil Service Commission Chair, Civil Service Commission Vice-Chair, Members of the Employee Relations Committee for Fiscal Year 2023-2024.

Appeals

The Civil Service Commission heard a protest for the performance test for Fire Battalion Chief on November 6, 2023, and denied the protest.

The Civil Service Commission heard a protest of the eligible list for the position of Fire Captain on February 5, 2024, and denied the protest.

The Civil Service Commission heard a protest of the oral interview for Warehouse Supervisor on February 26, 2024, and approved the protest.

The Civil Service Commission heard a protest for the eligible list for the position of Administrative Assistant on March 25, 2024, and denied the protest.

The Civil Service Commission heard three (3) protests of the eligible list for the position of Warehouse Supervisor on April 8, 2024, where one protest was denied and two (2) were continued to April 22, 2024, then to May 13, 2024, then to May 20, 2024. The Civil Service Commission approved the two (2) protests of the eligible list for the position of Warehouse Supervisor on May 20, 2024. Additionally, the Civil Service Commission approved the cancellation of the Warehouse Supervisor eligible list and approved the Human Resources Department's recommendation to readminister the oral interview exam for Warehouse Supervisor on May 20, 2024.

The Civil Service Commission heard a protest of the eligible list for the position of Custodian on June 10, 2024, and denied the protest.

Hearings

Appeals of discipline of five (5) Police Officers were denied on the following dates: October 16, 2023, January 22, 2024, March 4, 2024, March 18, 2024, and May 6, 2024.

Appeals of discipline of two (2) Police Services Officers were denied on August 14, 2023 and September 18, 2023.

An appeal of discipline of a Library Technician was withdrawn on October 23, 2023.

An appeal of discipline of a Storekeeper was withdrawn on November 27, 2023.

An appeal of discipline of a Reprographics Specialist is ongoing, with the hearing continued to a date to be determined.

There are eight (8) ongoing appeals of discipline for Police Officers. Three (3) hearings for Police Officers have been continued to a date to be determined. Four (4) hearings for Police Officers have been delegated to a hearing officer. One (1) hearing for a Police Officer is scheduled to continue on September 23, 2024. Additionally, there is an ongoing appeal of discipline of a Police Sergeant, which has been delegated to a hearing officer.

Honorable Chair and Members
of the Civil Service Commission
City Hall
Torrance, California

Honorable Members:

SUBJECT: APPROVE THE EXAMINATION FOR HAZARDOUS MATERIALS RESPONSE TEAM

RECOMMENDATION:

Recommendation of the Human Resources Director that your Honorable Body approve conducting the Hazardous Materials Response Team Premium Pay Assignment examination consisting of a Written Exam (100%). Staff is requesting approval for a two-year eligible list.

BACKGROUND/ANALYSIS

Premium pay for Fire Fighters, Fire Engineers and Fire Captains regularly assigned to the Hazardous Materials Response Team shall receive a hazard premium per Section 3.2E of the Torrance Fire Fighters Association (TFFA) Memorandum of Understanding.

This examination is to create an eligible list to provide the opportunity to be assigned to the Hazardous Materials Team, which receives the premium upon assignment. The previous eligible list promulgated on July 3, 2023 will be automatically cancelled per T.M.C. Section 14.16.4 upon approval of a new eligible list.

The examination will be based upon existing codes and ordinances, recommended good practices, technical knowledge of the job subject, and departmental rules and practices.

The previous examinations in 2023 and 2022 were weighted as follows: Written (100%). There will be no change to the exam type and weight.

Respectfully submitted,

HEDIEH KHAJAVI
HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR

By 
Tina Ortiz
Principal Human Resources Analyst

CONCUR


Hedieh Khajavi
Human Resources Director

NOTED:


Brianne Cohen
Civil Service Manager

6B

ARTICLE 3 - SPECIAL COMPENSATION PROVISIONS

SECTION 3.1 LONGEVITY PAY

- A. Employees in the Torrance Fire Fighters Association prior to September 11, 2022 covered by this agreement shall receive longevity pay in the following manner:
1. Commencing with the first day of the 8th year of service, 5% above base pay.
 2. Commencing with the first day of the 16th year of service, a total of 10% above base pay.
 3. Commencing with the first day of the 20th year of service, a total of 12.5% above base pay.
 4. Commencing with the first day of the 25th year of service, a total of 20% above base pay.

Employees hired into the Torrance Fire Fighters Association on or after September 11, 2022 covered by this agreement shall receive longevity pay in the following manner:

1. Commencing with the first day of the 8th year of service, 5% above base pay.
2. Commencing with the first day of the 16th year of service, a total of 10% above base pay.

- B. All longevity pay advancements shall be effective on the anniversary date of the required years of continuous service (unpaid leaves or inactive status in excess of ten (10) working shifts, except for extended military leave, shall be deducted in computing total service) as a regular employee of the City of Torrance or total years of service as a full-time regular employee with the City of Torrance Fire Department, whichever provides the longer term of service.

SECTION 3.2 PREMIUM PAY

Employees assigned to work requiring specified duties which require skills and abilities not contemplated in the employee's normal assignments in the areas described in this section shall receive premium pay only while so assigned.

Premiums requiring licenses/certificates will be implemented upon the start of the assignment to specified duties that require licenses/certifications. Assignments and reassignments shall be made by the Fire Chief subject to the approval of the City Manager according to workload and skills required, and subject to any special provisions specified in this section for any particular assignment. All premium pay, and whether it is reported to CalPERS and included in an employee's PERSable compensation, shall be determined by CalPERS as prescribed under Title 2 CCR Section 571. Any changes made by CalPERS regarding requirements for premium reporting shall initiate meet and confer.

Removal of employees for disciplinary reasons, or reasons of incompetence, or abolishing positions because of budgetary requirements shall be preceded by notice to employee organization representatives with the intent of precluding unfair actions.

E. Hazard Premium – Hazardous Materials Response Team Assignment

Employees in the classification of Fire Fighter, Fire Engineer, and Fire Captain regularly assigned to the Hazardous Materials Response Team shall receive a hazard premium of 13% above base hourly pay. The hazard premium will be paid as follows:

1. Upon permanent Assignment by the Fire Chief to the Hazardous Materials Response Team, and the employee has completed all required training, including Haz-Mat First Responder Operational State Certificate, Torrance Fire Department Hazardous Materials Basic Training, State Haz-Mat Technician/Specialist Modules A, B, C, D, F and G, the eligible employee shall receive 13% Hazard Premium above base hourly pay.
2. Eligible members of the Haz-Mat Staffing Pool will receive compensation for each shift they are utilized as one of the five daily rostered Haz-Mat positions and shall receive a 13% premium for each shift worked. Eligible Haz-Mat Staffing Pool employees shall have completed all training components of Section 3.2.E.1 above.
 - a. Members are eligible for the Haz-Mat Staffing Pool once successfully passing the Haz-Mat examination process, as shown in Appendix A. Members who have completed Haz-Mat courses as outlined above, who have not participated in the Haz-Mat examination process, can be eligible for the Haz-Mat Staffing Pool at the discretion of the Fire Chief.
3. Personnel permanently assigned to the Hazardous Materials Response Team are not eligible to receive the Paramedic in Rank Premium.
4. Captains and Engineers who receive the Paramedic in Rank Premium and are members of the Haz-Mat Staffing Pool, will receive an additional premium pay of 3% for each 24-hour shift (or fraction thereof) when utilized as one of the five rostered members of the Hazardous Materials Response Team.
 - a. To be eligible for the premium pay of 3%, members must meet have completed all training components of Section 3.2.E.1 above.

Employees shall be assigned by the Fire Chief or designee, with the concurrence of the City Manager, from an eligible list developed through selection process as shown in Appendix A.

F. Training Tower Assignment

Employees assigned to training tower operations will be facilitating the training and evaluations of the new Torrance Fire Recruits. Assigned members must maintain all current licenses and certifications specific to their current rank and position. During this assignment the employee shall receive a 15% premium above base hourly pay. Assignments shall be subject to the decision of the Fire Chief. The Fire Chief or designee's decision shall be final and not grievable.

While employees are assigned to training tower operations:

1. The 15% premium shall be included in the calculation of overtime pay.
2. The 15% premium is not included in the cash out and/or deferral of accrued leaves.

APPENDIX A
EXAMINATIONS FOR PREMIUM POSITIONS

A. GENERAL

1. Assignment to premium pay positions shall be made from appropriate assignment lists established by competitive selection.
2. Assignment lists will expire at the end of two years from date of establishment.
3. Unless otherwise indicated, the selection process shall consist of a written portion and an oral evaluation portion.
4. The written portion shall be weighted at 40% and the oral portion at 60%.
5. A passing grade must be achieved in each portion of the selection process.
6. The entire selection process shall be conducted by the Civil Service Commission, with monitoring by the Fire Department and the employee representation unit.
7. The scope of the examinations may include existing codes and ordinances, recommended good practices, technical knowledge of the job subject, departmental rules and practices, related skills, self-expression, personal records, educational achievements, personal appearance, and the ability to exercise good judgment under adverse conditions.
8. Wherever practical, the written portion of the examination shall be multiple choice type questions.
9. Oral raters from outside agencies may be utilized in order to gain expertise for certain positions where deemed necessary by the Fire Chief.
10. Members of the oral boards shall be appointed by the Fire Chief.
11. In the event that less than three (3) applications are received for any one of those premium positions normally filled from an eligibility list developed through a written and oral selection process as described in the Appendix, assignments shall be made by the Department Head based upon a review of employee applications and/or employment records. The decision of the Department Head is final and is not grievable.

B. PARAMEDICS

1. Assignments to premium pay positions for paramedics is dependent upon their certification upon completion of a training period conducted by an outside authorized agency.
2. The selection of paramedic trainees will be conducted in the manner outlined in the general provisions.

C. HAZARDOUS MATERIALS RESPONSE TEAM

1. The selection process for hazardous materials response team assignment may include a practical examination.

D. TEMPORARY STAFF ASSIGNMENTS

1. Employees assigned to temporary staff assignments shall be assigned by the Fire Chief.
2. The justification of assignments shall be based solely upon the judgment of the Fire Chief.

E. MAINTENANCE OF ELIGIBILITY LISTS

Development of a required eligibility list for a premium pay position will be initiated 90 days prior to an anticipated vacancy in such a position.

Honorable Chair and Members
of the Civil Service Commission
City Hall
Torrance, California

Honorable Members:

SUBJECT: APPOINT CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION CHAIR, CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION VICE-CHAIR, AND MEMBERS OF EMPLOYEE RELATIONS COMMITTEE FOR FISCAL YEAR 2024 – 2025.

RECOMMENDATION:

Recommendation of Civil Service Staff that:

1. Your Honorable Body appoint a Chair for Fiscal Year 2024 – 2025,
2. The Chair-elect appoints a Vice-Chair for Fiscal Year 2024 – 2025,
3. The Chair-elect appoints members of the Employee Relations Committee for Fiscal Year 2024 – 2025.

BACKGROUND AND ANALYSIS:

Section 13.10.5 of the Torrance Municipal Code (TMC) requires that each fiscal year, members of the Civil Service Commission appoint a Chair to serve for one (1) year and until a successor is appointed.

The practice of your Honorable Body has been that the incoming Chair appoints a Vice-Chair. Additionally, TMC Section 14.8.6 requires the Chair of the Civil Service Commission appoint members of the Employee Relations Committee.

Staff has prepared a history of the previous Commission Chairs, Vice-Chairs/Employee Relations Committee Chairs, and Commissioners appointment dates (Attachment B) to assist the Civil Service Commission in making appointments.

Respectfully Submitted,

By 
Jennica Chaparro
Senior Human Resources Analyst

CONCUR:



Brianne Cohen
Civil Service Manager

Attachment A: Torrance Municipal Code Sections 13.10.5 and 14.8.6

Attachment B: Civil Service Commission and Employee Relations Committee Chair History

Torrance Municipal Code Sections 13.10.5 and 14.8.6

13.10.5 APPOINTMENT OF A CHAIRMAN.

At the first meeting of the Commission in every fiscal year, the members shall appoint one (1) of their number as Chairman who shall hold office for one (1) year and until his successor is appointed.

14.8.6 EMPLOYEE RELATIONS COMMITTEE.

There is hereby established a three (3) member standing committee of the Civil Service Commission to be known as the Employee Relations Committee.

- a) The Committee shall be appointed by the Chairman of the Civil Service Commission but shall not include the Chairman.
- b) The Committee shall elect a Chairman and shall meet, after proper public notice, as required by the provisions of this Article or at the call of the Committee Chairman.
- c) Each of the parties involved in any dispute before the Committee shall have the right to preemptorily challenge one (1) Committee member, who shall then be removed from the Committee while the Committee is considering the pending matter.
- d) The Chairman of the Civil Service Commission shall appoint a temporary replacement for the challenge committee member to serve while the committee is considering the pending matter.

Civil Service Commission and Employee Relations Committee Chair History

<u>Fiscal Year</u>	<u>Commission Chair</u>	<u>Vice Chair/ERC Chair</u>
2022-2023	Adelsman	Hamada
2023-2024	Hamada	Herring

<u>Office</u>	<u>Commissioner</u>	<u>First Appointment</u>	<u>Current Term Begins</u>	<u>Current Term Expires</u>
Member	Adelsman	07/01/19	07/01/23	06/30/27
Member	Herring	12/01/20	07/01/24	06/30/28
Member	Hamada	07/01/21	07/01/21	06/30/25
Member	Sasaki	07/01/21	07/01/21	06/30/25
Member	Zygielbaum	07/01/22	07/01/22	06/30/26
Member	Kohus	10/11/22	07/01/23	06/30/27
Member	Lohnes	10/11/22	07/01/24	06/30/28